

Exhibit Cover Page

EXHIBIT D

Haverford Grievances

The hate crime perpetrated against one of our Palestinian community members was the direct result of the proliferation of anti-Arab and anti-Palestinian rhetoric on this campus and beyond. It has highlighted the longstanding need to provide for the safety and well-being of our Palestinian and Arab community members who this institution has failed.

Students gathered on November 27th at 8 PM with a sense of urgency and agreement on the following demands to the College. As a community, we feel that the College has failed to address the fundamental concerns of Palestinian Haverford students.

The atmosphere felt on campus is one that is devoid of humanity. Many students feel that they are uncared for, unheard, and feel concern and heartbreak over the treatment of their Palestinian peers particularly affected by the ongoing apartheid. This administration has approved the dissemination of harmful, divisive statements against members of our community that do not foster mutual trust, concern and respect, values under which we do not see the administration operating.

One particular area where our campus has failed is academic leniency. Many Palestinian, Arab, and Muslim students on campus do not feel supported by the academic departments despite the administration claiming the opposite.. No institutional policy currently exists to offer tangible support regarding the ongoing apartheid in Gaza, and there are currently no concrete steps to provide community avenues for academic accommodations. When Palestinian, Arab, and Muslim students not only see a member of their community nearly murdered but experience a tangible lack of support from their college administration, engaging in our college's rigorous academic environment becomes extraordinarily difficult.

The mental and emotional toll that the hate crime and ongoing violence in Palestine has had on Palestinian, Arab, and Muslim students has been overlooked and underestimated.

The multiple responses sent out by administration left students feeling disillusioned and unheard.¹ While many students felt that the second response² did more to address the

¹Wendy Raymond. "Haverford Student Hospitalized Following Shooting in Vermont." November 26, 2023. Wendy Raymond. "Supporting Each Other and Standing Against Antisemitism and Islamophobia." November 8, 2023.

Wendy Raymond. "War in Israel and Gaza." October 12, 2023.

Wendy Raymond. "Caring for One Another Following Weekend Violence" November 27, 2023.

²Wendy Raymond. "Caring for One Another Following Weekend Violence" November 27, 2023.

nature of the attack, not enough is being done by administration to actively transform the culture at Haverford into a safe one for Palestinian students, leaving the labor of support to students. There is a distinction between uplifting the voices of students and placing an undue burden on them to fight for their own ability to function as students and people on this campus. The jump to increase the presence of Campus Safety in particular made many students feel frustrated and unsafe when it was not a decision that had been made with the input of students or a consideration of how surveillance affects minority students on this campus. Overall, there has been a lack of humanity and grace from the administration towards all community members.

While students appreciate the sentiment of vigils and office hours, we believe that the needs of students at this time require further institutional support to ensure that our community feels heard and cared for as hatred and violence continue. Students are troubled by the silence and lack of urgency across our community and after the meeting yesterday many people are going back to their departments, athletic teams, affinity groups, and community spaces to advocate for one another. We are hopeful that if students are coming together, then administrators, faculty, and staff can also join us in making the following changes possible:

- I. Academic Leniency
- II. Culturally Competent Counselors
- III. Support for Faculty and Student Activism
- IV. Accountability and Restorative Action
- V. Transparency from the Board of Managers

Demands

1. Academic Leniency

We demand that the College ensure that academic leniency is proactively offered and guaranteed by the College with acknowledgment of the particular need for leniency for Palestinian students in the following ways:

- a. Extending the pass/fail period to Friday, December 22nd at noon.
- b. Allowing for courses taken pass/fail to count towards major requirements in the Fall 2023 semester and consideration for this policy to continue into the Spring 2024 semester.
- c. Not counting courses taken pass/fail this semester towards the cumulative total of the four allowable pass/fail credits in students' careers at Haverford.

- d. Providing resources, events, and educational material to faculty about the injustices perpetrated against the Palestinian people so that they are aware of the reality that Palestinian students are facing. This should include:
 - i. Developing frameworks for faculty to use inclusive anti-racist language in academic settings.
 - ii. Actively encouraging faculty to utilize these resources to stay educated on the campus climate and updates relating to Palestine.
 - iii. Communicating along with these resources that many students do not have the same capacity now as in a normal semester, particularly with regards to attendance and participation.
- e. Supporting faculty in immediately enacting the following policies:
 - i. Reaching out to all students offering a universal extension policy – upon request with no questions asked – that acknowledges the local and global context that may further necessitate these accommodations for Palestinian, Arab, and Muslim students.
 - ii. Retroactive academic leniency for outstanding assignments from October 7th onward, which should present itself as a proactive willingness to work with students who request that assignments be excused.
 - iii. Alternative final exam options and leniency on granting students incomplete grades in their courses to provide students with more time to complete exams.
 - iv. Providing lecture notes and/or Zoom recordings for all students so that those who are unable to attend can still have access to information covered in person.

We demand to meet with the Provost as soon as possible to have these points fully met by December 8th.

2. Culturally Competent Counselors

We demand that the College provides competent mental health services to students who are directly affected by the apartheid in Gaza, especially given that there is only one Muslim counselor at this time. This includes:

- a. Directly hiring (not outsourcing) Arab and Muslim CAPS counselors, specifically Arabic-speaking counselors as well.
- b. Counselors trained in providing trauma-informed counseling that is specifically tailored to grief, silencing, and targeting that Palestinian students have been facing since October 7th, but also the generational struggle within the larger context of the occupation.

- c. Easier access for Palestinian students to current CAPS services given the current barriers to accessing mental health on campus.

We demand to meet with the involved offices and administrators as soon as possible to ensure that these points are fully met by the beginning of next semester (February 2024).

3. Support for Faculty and Students' Activism

We demand Haverford ensure full protection for faculty and students who speak out about their positions related to the injustice in Palestine in the following ways:

- a. Academic freedom and freedom of speech includes the guaranteed right to speak about the current aggression on Gaza and its broader historical context.
- b. Provide support to international students and non-U.S citizen students regarding student activism and involvement.
 - i. Make an information session with legal advisors available to students to provide transparency on their protections when it comes to freedom of speech and student activism in the United States so that students have the tools needed to be safely involved in activism on and off campus.
 - ii. Expanding the available immigration legal counseling resources that are available to non-U.S citizen students to explicitly include support for students involved in student activism.
- c. Provide legal support regarding freedom of speech for faculty and staff upon request.
- d. Commit to a policy that ensures that future consideration for tenure-track faculty will not be negatively impacted for speaking up against the apartheid in Palestine, including no financial retributions.

We demand that the information session be held within a month of these demands' announcement, the guarantees of academic freedom within the College should be enacted immediately, and that the new support structures should be initiated by the end of the Spring semester.

4. Accountability and Restorative Action

We demand that the administration take accountability for the harm they inflicted upon the student body and that members of the administration carry out specific actions to mend this harm as highlighted below:

- a. Accountability and Restorative Action
 - i. Violation of Student Governance
 1. By undermining the voices of student government officers and failing to respond in a timely manner to emails sent by concerned members of the student body.
 - ii. Mismanagement of hc-allstudents policies
 1. By approving and sending hateful responses that target members of the student body with false accusations, and describing them with hostile, charged language such as “hijacking”³ and equating calls to end the genocide and ethnic cleansing of a people as ‘anti-semitic’. These responses undermine efforts in support of Palestinian people, promote anti-Arab sentiments, and contribute to the dehumanization of Palestinians that lead to violent attacks against them.
 - iii. Undermining student-initiated events
 1. By dismissing the numerous spaces for conversation that students have created.
 2. By undermining the power of student-led protests supported by a significant amount of the larger student body.
 - iv. Increase of Campus Safety presence on campus
 1. We ask for transparency and student input on increased presence of Campus Safety, future institutional safety measures, and ways we can protect ourselves beyond Campus Safety.
- b. Support and acknowledgment of the injustice enacted against Haverford alumni Elom Tettey-Tamaklo⁴, who was indefinitely suspended from his proctor duties at Harvard Divinity School for supporting Palestine.
- c. A statement from the College condemning the state of Israel as responsible for the ongoing apartheid by:
 - i. Acknowledging the Israeli attacks as a continued ethnic cleansing against the Palestinian people. In particular, an acknowledgment of

³ Allyson Landau. “Silenced Jewish Voices.” November 9, 2023.

⁴ Harvard College Palestine Solidarity Committee (PSC). “Tweet Message.” <https://twitter.com/HarvardPSC/status/1724630975773094249>.

the (nearly) full history laid out by the UN⁵, starting at the 1948 Nakba.

- ii. Calling for an explicit condemnation of the Israeli government's violent apartheid, as explained by Amnesty International⁶, as an institution that prides itself in its historical stance against South African apartheid.
- iii. Using the College's position as a respected PA institution to publicly call upon Senator Fetterman and Representative Scanlon to support a permanent ceasefire⁷ in alignment with other Quaker institutions' statements.⁸

We demand that point A be met by December 22nd through a statement and action plan from the President's Office and Dean of the College outlining how the College will respect student governance and students' right to organize. We also demand that students be involved in decision-making regarding institutional safety measures through the Campus Safety Advisory Committee.

We demand that point B be met by December 22nd through a statement from the President's Office expressing support for the reinstatement of Elom Tettey-Tamaklo.

We demand that point C be met by December 22nd through a public statement from the President's Office.

5. Transparency from the Board of Managers

We demand transparency from the Board of Managers, particularly from the Investment Committee and Executive Board. As well as student input in the Board of Managers Nomination Processes.

a. Transparency

- i. Institutional compliance with transparency about events that have transpired within the Board of Managers since October 7th,

⁵ United Nations, "Origins and Evolution of the Palestine Problem." <https://www.un.org/unispal/history2/origins-and-evolution-of-the-palestine-problem/>.

⁶ Amnesty International, "Israel's Apartheid Against Palestinians." <https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/campaigns/2022/02/israels-system-of-apartheid/>.

⁷ Representative Scanlon has supported a temporary ceasefire but has yet to voice support for a permanent one.

⁸ See Page 1.

including clarity about the resignation of a member⁹ and the withdrawal of specific scholarship funds that have affected the student body. This can take the form of an audit of events and a formal resignation procedure that includes communication with the Haverford community relating to the nature of the resignation and its implications.

- b. Representation of Palestinian voices in the Board of Managers
 - i. Appointment of at least one member of Palestinian descent.
- c. Investment procedures
 - i. Commitment to the ongoing conversations and process of divestment and separation from institutions and companies that enable and maintain violence against Palestinians.
 - ii. In recognition of the investment process at Haverford that includes an ESG (Environmental, Social, Governance) investment policy, we call on the College to establish a more robust investment policy that is in line with our Quaker values.
 - iii. In alignment with the American Friends Service Committee Social Responsibility Investment Policy¹⁰, we call on the College to develop a comparable investment policy that includes, but is not limited to the commitment that “Investments should not be made in companies which consistently, knowingly, and directly facilitate and enable state violence and repression, war and occupation, and/or severe violations of international law and human rights.”¹¹
 - iv. We demand that the College commit to the aforementioned Social Responsibility Investment Policy¹² as it applies to the Apartheid in Palestine, and take necessary steps to maintain this commitment as needed.
- d. Student representation in the Board of Managers’ Investment Committee
 - i. We demand at least 2 student representatives to be included in the Investment Committee to represent student values, including, but not limited to, anti-war, nonviolent Quaker ethics.
 - ii. Student representatives should be able to:
 - 1. Help guide investment policies in alignment with our Quaker values, including:
 - a. Access to dialogue with Investiture.

⁹ <https://haverfordclerk.com/alumna-claudia-hammerman-resigns-from-haverford-board-of-managers/>.

¹⁰ <https://afsc.org/sites/default/files/documents/Investment%20Policy%20Statement%202021.pdf>.

¹¹ <https://afsc.org/sites/default/files/documents/Investment%20Policy%20Statement%202021.pdf> (page 5).

¹² Ibid.

- b. Regular analyses of the College's investments to confirm that our investments are in line with our investment policies and Quaker values.
 - 2. Publicly report goals established by the Investment Committee to the Student Body and report any violations of the investment policy.
 - 3. Advocate and report on student representative goals and outcomes to the student body.
- e. Board of Managers Executive Board
 - i. Report the minutes of the Executive Board meetings to the student body.
- f. Student Input
 - i. Town hall-style meetings organized by the President's Office with Board of Managers members. These meetings should take place after each of the four Board meetings. Prior to this meeting, all reports about the meetings must be released. This space will be open to all students and be a platform for the Board to listen to student voices.
 - 1. $\frac{2}{3}$ of the Board of Meetings should be present in these town halls.
 - ii. During the third town hall, the student representatives should provide input and recommendations to the Board of Managers Nominations and Governance Committee on nominations for new Board of Managers members to take into account values and identities that matter to students.
 - 1. The demographic makeup of the Board of Managers should reflect the demographics of the campus as best as possible.

We demand that point A be met by December 22nd via a public report to the campus.

We demand that the Board of Managers' Nomination Processes begin to accommodate the requests of point B by the next nomination period in April.

We demand that conversations on investment procedures in point C be initiated within the next two weeks (by December 12th).

We demand that conversations on the Board of Managers' bylaws be initiated within the next two weeks in order to meet the demands

requested in points D, E, and F and see tangible amends by the next Board of Managers Weekend.

Haverford's Role as a Quaker Institution

“We are a people that follow after those things that make for peace, love, and unity; it is our desire that others’ feet may walk in the same, and do deny and bear our testimony against all strife, and wars.”¹³

– Margaret Fell, Founding member of the Religious Society of Friends

We conclude by saying that we ask for these things knowing that we elected to be a part of a community whose values are central to the way we are present on this campus and the changes we want to see.

The principal Quaker values that one raised in the faith grows up hearing (commonly abbreviated to S.P.I.C.E.S.) include *peace*, *equity*, and *stewardship*. Haverford College has failed to live up to these values it was founded with and claims to follow today. The Quaker United Nations Office (QUNO), The American Friends Service Committee, The Philadelphia Yearly Meeting, and the Friends Committee on National Legislation have all called for a ceasefire and condemned Israel’s apartheid in Gaza.¹⁴ Paradoxically, Haverford College as a “Quaker” institution is not following suit. By continuing to vocally and monetarily support the government of Israel in its ongoing apartheid of the Palestinian people, Haverford College does not honor peace, and does not foster a safe community for Palestinian Fords. Peace is not limited to moments of silence and vigils—it is a goal that we all must actively work towards. Quakers have a long history of anti-war action. It is inappropriate for Haverford to use its position as a historically Quaker institution as an excuse for remaining silent or trying to take a “both sides” approach on apartheid. Peace is not a passive practice. We have unfortunately also seen this behavior of hiding behind “peace” before from Quaker institutions. From Quaker corporations’ implication in South African Apartheid, to the long history of prominent Quakers’ enslavement of Black people in the United States and Quaker involvement in the abuse of Indigenous people in the US and Canada, Haverford cannot afford to be part of this legacy of inaction. In the past Haverford has stood out among Quaker institutions for being vocal in its disapproval of apartheid in South Africa; we ask that you have the same initiative in opposing apartheid now in Palestine.

Haverford has failed to exercise the value of *equity* in its language and behavior about the apartheid in Palestine. Time and time again, Haverford has been putting the voices of its Zionist students above the experiences of its Palestinian (and specifically Gazan) students. These offenses include approving the inappropriate hc-allstudents

¹³ <https://qfp.quaker.org.uk/passage/19-46/>.

¹⁴ <https://quno.org/sites/default/files/timeline/files/2023/quaker-statement-on-gaza-10-17-23.pdf>.

email calling anti-Zionist students anti-Jewish, and centering Israeli suffering while initially brushing off Gazan suffering. This inequitable treatment of student voices is inexcusable.

Above all, the College has failed to engage with the Quaker value of *stewardship*, the value of caretaking of one's community. Approving hc-allstudents emails that target specific community members already vulnerable to marginalization¹⁵, failing to condemn ongoing violence against fellow students, faculty, and staff, labeling Jewish students who condemn Israel as "antisemitic," weaponizing anti-Arab and anti-Palestinian talking points, and neglecting to provide adequate counseling/emotional support for its Palestinian students, are all antithetical to principles of community care. The continued lack of adequate response to the safety and well-being of our Palestinian community members is a failure to foster stewardship and engage in community care. Specific remedies to this issue are outlined in the demands and we are hopeful that these efforts will create a safer, more compassionate, and human community to leave behind for the generations to come.

We ask for a full response to these grievances by Friday, December 1st.

-Haverford Students for Peace

¹⁵ Allyson Landau and students. "Silenced Jewish Voices." November 9, 2023